XAVIER BECERRA 1 Attorney General of California 2 JOSHUA A. ROOM Supervising Deputy Attorney General 3 BRETT A. KINGSBURY Deputy Attorney General 4 State Bar No. 243744 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004 5 Telephone: (415) 703-1192 6 Facsimile: (415) 703-5480 Attorneys for Complainant 7 BEFORE THE 8 DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR 9 STATE OF CALIFORNIA 10 In the Matter of the Accusation Against: Case No. 79/17-2296 11 MITCHEL SCOTT BORNSTEIN -12 PRESIDENT/SECRETARY/TREASURER, REID VENTURES, D.B.A. BERKELEY 13 SMOG TEST ONLY CENTER ACCUSATION 1010 Carleton St., #A Smog Check 14 Berkeley, CA 94710 **Automotive Repair Dealer Registration** 15 ARD No. 269642 Smog Check, Test Only, Station License 16 No. TC 269642, 17 JESSIE LEWIS KENT 1010 Cavelton Street, Suite A 18 Berkeley, CA 94710 Smog Check Inspector License 19 No. EO 630955 Smog Check Repair Technician 20 No. EI 630955 (formerly EA 630955), 21 and 22 /// 23 /// 24 III25 /// 26 /// 27 /// 28

(BERKELEY SMOG TEST ONLY et. al.) ACCUSATION

DAMIEN FRANCIS ROCHELLS

MAILING ADDRESS:

Smog Check Inspector License

Smog Check Repair Technician

Respondents.

Complainant alleges:

PARTIES

- Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair (Bureau), Department of Consumer Affairs.
- On or about July 22, 2012, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 269642 to Mitchel Scott Bornstein - President/Secretary/Treasurer, Reid Ventures d.b.a. Berkeley Smog Test Only Center (Respondent Shop). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on July 31, 2018, unless renewed.
- On or about July 19, 2012, the Bureau issued Smog Check, Test Only, Station License Number TC 269642 to Respondent Shop. The Smog Check, Test Only, Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on July 31, 2018, unless renewed.
- On or about April 16, 2009, the Bureau issued Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License No. 630955 to Jessie Lewis Kent (Respondent Kent). Effective February 28, 2013, pursuant to Respondent Kent's election, said license was renewed as Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 630955 and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 630955. The Smog Check Repair Technician License expired on February 28, 2015, and has not been renewed. The

¹ Effective August 1, 2012, California Code of Regulations, title 16, sections 3340.28, 3340.29, and 3340.30 were amended to implement a license restructure from the Advanced Emission Specialist Technician (EA) License and Basic Area Technician (EB) License to Smog Check Inspector (EO) License and/or Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License.

Smog Check Inspector License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on February 28, 2019, unless renewed.

5. In 2005, the Bureau issued Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License No. 150861 to Damien Francis Rochells (Respondent Rochells). Effective August 31, 2012, pursuant to Respondent Rochells's election, said license was renewed as Smog Check Inspector License No. E0 150861 and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 150861. The Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License were in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges herein and will expire on August 31, 2018, unless renewed.

JURISDICTION

- 6. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau under the authority of the following laws.
- 7. Section 9884.13 of the Business and Professions Code (Code) provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director or Bureau Chief of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision invalidating a registration temporarily or permanently.
- 8. Section 44072.6 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director, or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license, shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.
- 9. Section 44002 of the Health and Safety Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS

- 10. Section 9884.7 of the Code states, in pertinent part:
- "(a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may deny, suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive

technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.

"(1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading.

"(4) Any other conduct that constitutes fraud.

- 11. Section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code requires that tests at smog check stations be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
 - 12. Section 44059 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

"The willful making of any false statement or entry with regard to a material matter in any oath, affidavit, certificate of compliance or noncompliance, or application form which is required by this chapter or Chapter 20.3 (commencing with Section 9880) of Division 3 of the Business and Professions Code, constitutes perjury and is punishable as provided in the Penal Code."

13. Section 44072.2 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part:

"The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the following:

"(a) Violates any section of this chapter and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the licensed activities.

- "(c) Violates any of the regulations adopted by the director pursuant to this chapter.
- "(d) Commits any act involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another is injured."
- 14. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.24(c) states: "The bureau may suspend or revoke the license of or pursue other legal action against a licensee, if the licensee falsely or fraudulently issues or obtains a certificate of compliance or a certificate of noncompliance."
 - 15. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.30 states, in pertinent part:

COSTS

18. Section 125.3 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Bureau may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case, with failure of the licentiate to comply subjecting the license to not being renewed or reinstated. If a case settles, recovery of investigation and enforcement costs may be included in a stipulated settlement.

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 19. On March 9, 2015, the Bureau implemented a statewide regulatory change requiring the use of the On Board Diagnostic Inspection System (BAR-OIS) instead of the Emission Inspection System (EIS) for the smog testing of 2000 model year and newer gas powered and hybrid vehicles.
- 20. The new BAR-OIS smog inspection utilizes a Data Acquisition Device (DAD), a computer, a bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD is a scan tool that retrieves data from a vehicle's On Board Diagnostic-generation II (OBD II) computer. The DAD connects the BAR-OIS computer to the vehicle's diagnostic link connector (DLC) to retrieve the data from the vehicle. The bar code scanner is used to input technician information, the vehicle identification number (VIN), and DMV renewal information. The printer is used to print Vehicle Inspection Reports.
- 21. Data retrieved and recorded during an BAR-OIS smog check can include: the eVIN, which is the digitally stored VIN programmed into the vehicle's Powertrain Control Module (PCM); the communication protocol, which is the manufacturer/vehicle's specific "language" that the PCM uses to relay information; and the number of Parameter Identifications (PIDs), which is the number of specific data values that vehicle's PCM provides related to emission controls.
- 22. As part of BAR-OIS smog inspections, the technician also performs a visual and functional test on the vehicle. The BAR-OIS software makes the determination whether or not the vehicle passes the inspection based on the results of the data and the visual and functional tests. If the vehicle passes the inspection, a certificate of compliance is issued. The information from

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

CLEAN	2009 Subaru Forester 2.5X, VIN: JF2SH61679H776861			
PLUG # 1	Technician: Respondent Kent			
	<u>Cert. # PQ706458C</u>	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Cour
	Fraudulent Inspection	Not Reported.	19140808	16
	(4/9/2015)			
	Expected Value	JF2SH61679H776861	ICAN11bt5	45 3
CLEAN	2002 Toyota (Camry LE/XLE/SE, VIN	: JTDBE32K8200'	79141
PLUG # 2	Technician: Respondent Kent			
	<u>Cert. # PS343610C</u>	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count
	Fraudulent Inspection	JTNBE46KX73000361	ICAN11bt500	39
	(5/22/2015)			
	Expected Value	Not Reported.	1914	17
	Prior inspection of same	Not Reported.	19140808	17
	vehicle (aborted)			
	(4/23/2015)			
///				
///				
///				
///				
///				
///				
///				
///				
///				
///				

CLEAN	2002 Acura 3.2 TL Type-S, VIN: 19UUA56972A006460				
PLUG # 3	Technician: Respondent Kent				
	Cert. # ZB268618C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (3/29/2016)	2HNYD18876H501098 ³	19140808	25	
	Expected Value	Not Reported.	1914	16	
	Prior inspection of same vehicle (passed) (4/30/2014)	Not Reported.	19140808	16	
CLEAN	2007 Toyota Prius, VIN: JTDKB20UX73249223				
PLUG # 4	Technician: Respondent Rochells				
	<u>Cert. # ZB721858C</u>	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Count	
	Fraudulent Inspection (4/11/2016)	Not Reported.	KWPS**	21 11 8 17 10	
	Expected Value	JTDKB20UX73249223	ICAN11bt5	37 21 17, 38 21 17, or 38 21 5	
///					
///					
///					
///					
///					
transmitted	³ Another vehicle, tested at Respondent Shop by Respondent Kent on March 30, 2016, itted the same eVIN, communication protocol, and PID count as that transmitted during tlent inspection.				
	•				
		9			

CLEAN	2009 BMW 328I, VIN: WBAPH77579NL84048				
PLUG # 5	Technician: Respondent Kent				
	Cert. # QG006680C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Coun	
	Fraudulent Inspection	5J6RE3H71AL0510584	ICAN29bt500	37 20	
	(10/10/2016)				
	Expected Value	WBAPH77579NL84048	ICAN11bt5	45 or 45 1	
CLEAN	2002 Chevrolet Silverado C1500, VIN: 2GCEC19V921359694				
PLUG # 6	Technician: Respondent Kent				
	Cert. # ZL423659C	eVIN Number	Protocol	PID Coun	
	Fraudulent Inspection	Not Reported.	I9140808	18 13 1 3	
	(12/1/2016)				
	Expected Value	2GCEC19V921359694	JVPW	22	
	Prior inspection of same	2GCEC19V921359694	JVPW1850	22	
	vehicle (failed)				
	(10/21/2016)				
///					
///					
///					
///					
///					
///					
///					
///					
4 A1	nother vehicle, tested at R	espondent Shop by Respo	ondent Kent on the	e same day,	
transmitted fraudulent i	the same eVIN, commun inspection.	ication protocol, and PID	count as that trans	smittea aurin	
		10			

	 					
1	CLEAN	2007 Honda CR-V LX, VIN: JHLRE48367C028587				
2	PLUG # 7	Technician: Respondent Kent				
3		Cert.# ZL423668C	eVIN Number	<u>Protocol</u>	PID Count	
4		Fraudulent Inspection	5J6RM4H74EL092556	ICAN29bt500	37	
5		(12/1/2016)				
6		Expected Value	JHLRE48367C028587	lCAN29bt5	39 19	
7						
8	CLEAN	2008 Toyota Highlander Hybrid, VIN: JTEEW41A382010973				
9	PLUG#8	Technician: Respondent Kent				
10		Cert. # ZN874261C	<u>eVIN Number</u>	Protocol	PID Count	
11		Fraudulent Inspection	Not Reported.	JVPW1850	18	
12		(1/23/2017)				
13		Expected Value	JTEEW41A382010973	ICAN11bt5	45 21	
14						
15	FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE					
16		(Misleading Statements - Registration)				
17	28.	Respondent Shop has sul	ojected its registration to	discipline under C	ode section	

28. Respondent Shop has subjected its registration to discipline under Code section 9884.7(a)(1), in that Respondent Shop made statements which it knew or which by the exercise of reasonable care it should have known were untrue or misleading, as set forth above in Factual Background. Respondent Shop purported to test the eight vehicles and certified that the eight vehicles passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondent Shop conducted the inspections on those vehicles using clean-plugging methods.

SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Fraud - Registration)

29. Respondent Shop has subjected its registration to discipline under Code section 9884.7(a)(4), in that it committed acts which constitute fraud, as set forth above in Factual Background.

///

14

15 16

17

18 19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26 27

28

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit – Station License)

31. Respondent Shop has subjected its station license to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(d), in that Respondent Shop committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit, whereby another was injured, by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. The circumstances are set forth above in detail in Factual Background.

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Kent's Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License)

- 32. Respondent Kent has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(a) and (c), in that he violated sections of the Health and Safety Code and applicable regulations, as set forth above in Factual Background, as follows:
- Health and Safety Code Section 44012: Respondent Kent failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. Health and Safety Code Section 44059: Respondent Kent willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance by certifying that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not.
- California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.30(a): Respondent Kent failed to inspect and test the vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035 and/or California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- d. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.41(c): Respondent Kent entered into the emissions inspection system vehicle identification information or emission

control system identification data for a vehicle other than the one being tested, and/or knowingly entered into the emissions inspection system false information about the vehicles being tested.

e. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.42: Respondent Kent failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on the vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit – Respondent Kent's Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License)

33. Respondent Kent has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(d), in that he committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured, when he willfully made false entries on the electronic certificates of compliance and certified that the vehicles had been inspected as required when, in fact, they had not, depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. The circumstances are described in more detail above in Factual Background.

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Rochells's Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License)

- 34. Respondent Rochells has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(a) and (c), in that he violated sections of the Health and Safety Code and applicable regulations, as set forth above in Factual Background, as follows:
- a. Health and Safety Code Section 44012: Respondent Rochells failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicle in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. Health and Safety Code Section 44059: Respondent Rochells willfully made false entries on the electronic certificate of compliance by certifying that the vehicle had been inspected as required when, in fact, it had not.

- c. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.30(a): Respondent Rochells failed to inspect and test the vehicle in accordance with Health and Safety Code sections 44012 and 44035 and/or California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- d. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.41(c): Respondent Rochells entered into the emissions inspection system vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for a vehicle other than the one being tested, and/or knowingly entered into the emissions inspection system false information about the vehicle being tested.
- e. California Code of Regulations, title 16, Section 3340.42: Respondent Rochells failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on the vehicle in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit – Respondent Rochells's Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License)

35. Respondent Rochells has subjected his Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License to discipline under Health and Safety Code section 44072.2(d), in that he committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another was injured, when he willfully made false entries on the electronic certificate of compliance and certified that the vehicle had been inspected as required when, in fact, it had not, depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. The circumstances are described in more detail above in Factual Background.

OTHER MATTERS

36. Pursuant to section 9884.7(c) of the Code, the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the automotive repair dealer registrations for all places of business operated in this state by Respondent Shop upon a finding that Respondent Shop has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.

///

///

- 37. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent Shop's station license is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Shop may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 38. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent Kent's Smog Check Inspector License or Smog Check Repair Technician License are revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Kent may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 39. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Respondent Rochells's Smog Check Inspector License or Smog Check Repair Technician License are revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Rochells may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD
 269642, issued to Mitchel Scott Bornstein President/Secretary/Treasurer, Reid Ventures d.b.a.
 Berkeley Smog Test Only Center (Respondent Shop);
- 2. Revoking or suspending any other automotive repair dealer registration issued to Mitchel Scott Bornstein;
- Revoking or suspending Smog Check, Test Only, Station License Number TC
 269642, issued to Respondent Shop;
- 4. Revoking or suspending any other license issued under Chapter 5, Part 5, Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Mitchel Scott Bornstein;
- 5. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 630955, issued to Jessie Lewis Kent (Respondent Kent);
- 6. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 630955, issued to Respondent Kent;