1	XAVIER BECERRA		
2	Attorney General of California THOMAS L. RINALDI		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General HEATHER VO		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 223418		
	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702		•
5	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6317		
6	Facsimile: (213) 897-2804 Attorneys for Complainant		
7			
8	BEFOR DEPARTMENT OF CO		
9	FOR THE BUREAU OF A STATE OF C	AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR	
10			
11		1	
12	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/17-17041	
13	TUONG DINH NGUYEN, President; dba		
14	CARMEN AUTO CENTER, INC. 256 Carmen Drive	ACCUSATION	
15	Camarillo, CA 93010		
16	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 271366		
17	Smog Check Station No. RC 271366		
18	And		
19	JASON AMES ENGLAND 190 Silver Fern Ct.		
20	Simi Valley, CA 93065		
21	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 140143	·	
22	Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 140143		
23	Respondents.		
24	0 11		
	Complainant alleges:		
25	PART		
26	Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings t	•	1 7
27	the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair, De	epartment of Consumer Affa	airs.
28			
	i	A Company of the Comp	

Automotive Repair Dealer Registration

2. On or about January 7, 2013, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 271366 to Respondent Tuong Dinh Nguyen, President, dba Carmen Auto Center, Inc. (Respondent Carmen Auto Center). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on January 31, 2019, unless renewed.

Smog Check Station

3. On or about January 16, 2013, the Bureau issued Smog Check Station License No. RC 271366 to Respondent Carmen Auto Center. The Smog Check Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on January 31, 2019, unless renewed.

STAR Certified Station

4. On or about February 13, 2013, the Bureau issued STAR Certification to Respondent Carmen Auto Center. The STAR Station Certification was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will remain active unless the ARD registration and/or the Smog Check Station license is revoked, cancelled, or the licenses become delinquent or certification is invalidated.

Smog Check Inspector (EO) and Smog Check Repair Technician (EI)

5. In 1998, Advanced Emission Specialist (EA) Technician License No. EA 140143 was issued to Jason Ames England (Respondent England) and was due to expire on July 31, 2012; however, was cancelled on July 24, 2012. On or about July 24, 2012, the Bureau issued Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 140143 and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 140143 pursuant to Respondent England's election¹. The Smog Check Inspector License (EO) and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. (EI) was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on July 31, 2020, unless renewed.

¹ Effective August 1, 2012, an Amendment to Sections 3340.28, 3340.29 and 3340.30, of Article 2, Chapter 1, Division 33, Title 16, CCR implemented a License restructure of Smog Check Technician (EA/EB) license types to Smog Check Inspector (EO) license and Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) license.

JURISDICTION

- 6. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau of Automotive Repair, under the authority of the following laws.
- 7. Business and Professions Code ("Bus. & Prof. Code") section 9884.7 provides that the Director may revoke an automotive repair dealer registration.
- 8. Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.13 provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision temporarily or permanently invalidating (suspending or revoking) a registration.
- 9. Health and Safety Code ("Health & Saf. Code") section 44002 provides, in pertinent part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.
- 10. Health & Saf. Code section 44072.6 provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director of Consumer Affairs, or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.

STATUTORY PROVISIONS

- 11. Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7 states, in pertinent part:
- (a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may refuse to validate, or may invalidate temporarily or permanently, the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.
- (1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading.
 - (4) Any other conduct that constitutes fraud.
- (6) Failure in any material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it.

(c) Notwithstanding subdivision (b), the director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by an automotive repair dealer upon a finding that the automotive repair dealer has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of this chapter, or regulations adopted pursuant to it.

- 12. Bus. & Prof. Code section 477 provides, in pertinent part, that "Board" includes "bureau," "commission," "committee," "department," "division," "examining committee," "program," and "agency." "License" includes certificate, registration or other means to engage in a business or profession regulated by the Bus. & Prof. Code.
- 13. Section 44012 of the Health & Saf. Code provides, in pertinent part, that tests at smog check stations shall be performed in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- 14. Section 44015, subdivision (b), of the Health & Saf. Code provides that a certificate of compliance shall be issued if a vehicle meets the requirements of Health & Saf. Code section 40012.
 - 15. Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2 states, in pertinent part:

The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the following:

- (a) Violates any section of this chapter [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health and Saf. Code § 44000, et seq.)] and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the licensed activities.
- (c) Violates any of the regulations adopted by the director pursuant to this chapter.
- (d) Commits any act involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another is injured . . .
- 16. Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8 states that when a license has been revoked or suspended following a hearing under this article, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of the licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the director.
 - 17. Health & Saf. Code section 44072.10 states, in pertinent part:

• • • •

28

being tested."

5

11

10

13

14

12

15

17

16

18 19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26 27

28

23. CCR, title 16, section 3340.42, sets forth specific emissions test methods and procedures which apply to all vehicles inspected in the State of California.

COST RECOVERY

Bus. & Prof. Code section 125.3 provides, in pertinent part, that a Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case.

VID DATA REVIEW

- 25. On March 9, 2015, the Bureau implemented a policy change requiring the use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System (OIS) in testing of 2000 model year and newer gas powered vehicles 14,000 Gross Vehicle Weight Rating (GVW) and under, and 1998 and newer diesel powered vehicles 14,000 GVW and under. The OIS Bureau Test Data lists differences in Vehicle Identification Numbers (VIN) for vehicles that have received smog inspections, in addition to communication protocol (the language used to communicate) and Parameter ID (PID) differences with vehicles that have been certified correctly that are the same make and model vehicles.
- 26. On or about October 12, 2017, Bureau representative Ian Evans initiated an investigation in which he reviewed OIS test data for Carmen Auto Center, Inc. Representative Evans' investigation revealed that the data related to certain vehicles certified by Carmen Auto Center, Inc. contained a pattern of unmistakable discrepancies between the information transmitted during the inspections and documented information known about the subject vehicles. Specifically, representative Evans compared the data received from the certified vehicles to data from vehicles of the same year, make, and model and determined that the data from at least five (5) of the certified vehicles contained the following unmistakable discrepancies: (1) incorrect eVIN; (2) incorrect vehicle communication protocols; and (3) incorrect PID counts. These documented discrepancies confirm that the vehicles receiving smog certificates from Carmen Auto Center Inc. were fraudulently tested during the smog inspection using the clean plugging

method.² The following chart illustrates the documented clean plugging activities of Respondents between September 3, 2015, to July 23, 2017.

Test Date	Vehicle Certified & License No.	Certificate No.	Details	OIS Test Data Details
Vehicle #1 9/3/2015	2005 Chevrolet Corvette Lic. 5SKP669 ³	Cert. YV138099C	EO 140143 (Respondent England)	Comm. Protocol: Matched PID Count: 45/7/8 (expected: 43, or 43/7 eVIN: Incorrect
Vehicle #2 11/28/2015	2005 BMW 325 SULEV Lic. 5355KDP ⁴	Cert. QA463062C	EO 140143 (Respondent England)	Comm. Protocol: KWPF (expected: I914) PID Count: 23 (expected: 22/8) eVIN: Incorrect
,		·		

² Clean plugging refers to the use of another vehicle's properly functioning On Board Diagnostic, generation II, (OBD II) system, or another source, to generate passing diagnostic readings for the purpose of issuing fraudulent smog Certificates of Compliance to vehicles that are not in smog compliance and/or not present for testing.

³ This vehicle was previously tested at another smog check station on January 17, 2017. The OIS Test Detail for that test indicated a correct eVIN was transmitted, had the expected communication protocol as ICAN11bt5, and transmitted a PID count as 43/7, all as expected.

⁴ This vehicle was subsequently tested at another smog check station on October 4, 2017. The OIS Test Detail for that test indicated a correct eVIN was transmitted, had the expected communication protocol as I914, and transmitted a PID count as 22/8, all as expected.

	<u>,</u>					
1 2 3 4 5	Vehicle #3 12/26/2015	2005 BMW M3 Lic. 5LRV027 ⁵	Cert. QC130005C	EO 140143 (Respondent England)	Comm. Protocol: ICAN11bt5 (expected: I914) PID Count: 46/14 (expected: 22, 23, 23/1 24, or 24/1) eVIN: Incorrect	,
6 7 8 9	Vehicle #4 9/12/2016	2006 Toyota Corolla CE/LE/S Lic. 5NUC454 ⁶	Cert. ZJ835398C	EO 140143 (Respondent England)	Comm. Protocol: ICAN11bt5 (expected: I914) PID Count: 46 (expected: 17, or 18) eVIN: Incorrect	
11 12 13 14 15	Vehicle #5 7/23/2017	2003 Ford Expedition XLT Lic. 5DVJ745 ⁷	Cert. ZZ571064C	EO 140143 (Respondent England)	Comm. Protocol: ICAN11bt5 (expected: JPWM) PID Count: 38 (expected: 22) eVIN: Incorrect	
16						Γ

27. The data analysis conducted on Respondent Carmen Auto Center's smog check between September 3, 2015, to July 23, 2017 shows that Respondent participated in a scheme to perform at least five (5) fraudulent smog check inspections resulting in the issuance of five (5) fraudulent electronic smog check certificates of compliance.

⁵ This vehicle was previously tested at another smog check station on February 14, 2017. The OIS Test Detail for that test indicated a correct eVIN was transmitted, had the expected communication protocol as I914, and transmitted a PID count as 23/1, all as expected.

⁶ This vehicle was previously tested at another smog check station on September 29, 2016. The OIS Test Detail for that test indicated a correct eVIN was transmitted, had the expected communication protocol as I914, and transmitted a PID count as 18, all as expected.

⁷ This vehicle was previously tested at another smog check station on August 14, 2015. The OIS Test Detail for that test indicated a correct eVIN was transmitted, had the expected communication protocol as JPWM, and transmitted a PID count as 22, all as expected.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Untrue or Misleading Statements)

28. Respondent Carmen Auto Center's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that it made or authorized statements which it knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading, as follows: Respondent Carmen Auto Center certified that the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, had passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondent Carmen Auto Center conducted the inspections of the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, using clean-plugging methods in that it substituted or used a different vehicle(s), or another source, during the OBD II functional tests in order to issue smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles. Respondent Carmen Auto Center did not test or inspect any of the 5 vehicles as required by Health & Saf. Code section 44012. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Fraud)

29. Respondent Carmen Auto Center's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that it committed acts that constitute fraud by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Material Violation of Automotive Repair Act)

30. Respondent Carmen Auto Center's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(6), in that it

failed in a material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it when it issued electronic certificates of compliance for the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 31. Respondent Carmen Auto Center's Smog Check Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that it failed to comply with the following sections of that Code:
- a. <u>Section 44012</u>: Respondent Carmen Auto Center failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. <u>Section 44015</u>: Respondent Carmen Auto Center issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health & Saf. Code section 44012.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

32. Respondent Carmen Auto Center's Smog Check Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that it failed to comply with provisions of California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:

- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent Carmen Auto Center falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above.
- b. <u>Section 3340.35, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent Carmen Auto Center issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, even though the vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42.
- c. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent Carmen Auto Center knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above.
- d. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent Carmen Auto Center failed to ensure that the required smog tests were conducted on the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit)

33. Respondent Carmen Auto Center's Smog Check Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that it committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the 5 vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

34. Respondent England's Smog Check Inspector License (EO) and Smog Check Repair Technician License (EI) are subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section

44072.2, subdivision (a), in that he failed to comply with section 44012 of that Code in a material respect, as follows: Respondent failed to perform the emission control tests on 5 of the vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 35. Respondent England's Smog Check Inspector License (EO) and Smog Check Repair Technician License (EI) are subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that he failed to comply with provisions of California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent England falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for 5 of the vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above.
- b. <u>Section 3340.30, subdivision (a)</u>: Respondent England failed to inspect and test 5 of the vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, in accordance with Health & Saf. Code sections 44012 and 44035, and California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.
- c. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent England knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for 5 of the vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above.
- d. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent England failed to conduct the required smog tests on 5 of the vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit)

36. Respondent England's Smog Check Inspector License (EO) and Smog Check Repair Technician License (EI) are subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that he committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby

another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for 5 of the vehicles identified in paragraph 26 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 26 through 27, above, as though set forth fully herein.

PRIOR DISCIPLINARY ACTION

- 37. On or about May 24, 2016, Citation #C2016-1112 was issued to Carmen Auto Center, Inc., Tuong Dinh Nguyen, President, for issuing a Certificate of Compliance to a vehicle using the BAR97 when an OBD Inspection System (OIS) was required. On June 10, 2016, a Citation Service Conference was held and the Citation was dismissed on July 11, 2016.
- 38. On or about May 24, 2016, Citation #M2016-1113 was issued to Jason Ames England for issuing a Certificate of Compliance to a vehicle using the BAR97 when an OBD Inspection System (OIS) was required. On June 20, 2016, a Citation Service Conference was held and the Citation was dismissed on August 2, 2016.

OTHER MATTERS

- 39. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by Tuong Dinh Nguyen upon a finding that Tuong Dinh Nguyen has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 40. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Station License RC 271366, issued to Tuong Dinh Nguyen is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 41. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 140143 and Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 140143 issued to James Ames England, is revoked or suspended, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5

of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged. and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 271366, issued to Carmen Auto Center, Inc., Tuong Dinh Nguyen, President;
- Revoking or suspending any other automotive repair dealer registration issued to Carmen Auto Center, Inc., Tuong Dinh Nguyen, President:
- Revoking or suspending Smog Check Station License Number RC 271366, issued to Respondent Carmen Auto Center, Inc., Tuong Dinh Nguyen, President:
- 4. Revoking or suspending any additional license under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Carmen Auto Center, Inc., Tuong Dinh Nguyen,
- Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 140143 issued to
- Revoking or suspending Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 140143
- Revoking or suspending any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Jason Ames England;
- Ordering Respondent Carmen Auto Center, Inc., Tuong Dinh Nguyen, President; and Respondent Jason Ames England to pay the Bureau of Automotive Repair the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of this case, pursuant to Business and Professions Code section

25

Ĭ.	9. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.
2	
3	
4	T_{1}
5	DATED: July 6, 2018 taluck Horais
6	Chief
7	Bureau of Automotive Repair Department of Consumer Affairs State of California
8	Complainant
9	
10	
11	
12	LA2018500542 62850541_2.docx
13	
14	
15	
16	a no no
17	
18	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	8
28	
	Y