1	XAVIER BECERRA Attorney General of California						
2	ARMANDO ZAMBRANO Supervising Deputy Attorney General	-					
3	Brian Lee						
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 253592						
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6621						
6	Telephone: (213) 269-6621 Facsimile: (213) 897-2804						
7	Attorneys for Complainant						
8	BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS						
9	FOR THE BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR STATE OF CALIFORNIA						
10							
11	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/18-1079					
12	SMOG ALL, ISSA S. MAYMOUN						
13	(OWNER) 3505 East Palmdale Blvd.	ACCUSATION					
14	Palmdale, CA 93550 Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No.						
15	ARD 225167 Smog Check Station License No. TC 225167						
16	ISSA SALLBA MAYMOUN						
17	3505 East Palmdale Blvd. Palmdale, CA 93550						
18	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 145531 Smog Check Repair License No. EI 145531						
19	and						
20	JALAL ISSA HADDAD						
21	2037 Krystal Avenue Lancaster, CA 93536						
22	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 637761						
23	OTHER RELATED LICENSES						
24	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 227311						
25	Smog Check Station License No. TC 227311	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					
26	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 279248						
27	Smog Check Station License No. TC 279248						
28	Respondents.						
	(IGGA G MAVMOLINI IND A SMOO ALL	I GGA GATI DA MAVMOTINI, TATAT 1994 TIADDAD					
	(ISSA S. MAYMOUN DBA SMOG ALL; ISSA SALLBA MAYMOUN; JALAL ISSA HADDAD) ACCUSATION						

<u>PARTIES</u>

- 1. Patrick Dorais (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair ("Bureau"), Department of Consumer Affairs.
- 2. In 2002, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 225167 to Issa S. Maymoun dba Smog All ("Respondent Smog All"). The Automotive Repair Dealer Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on December 31, 2018, unless renewed.
- 3. On or about December 23, 2002, the Bureau issued Smog Check, Test Only, Station License Number TC 225167 to Respondent Smog All. The Smog Check, Test Only, Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on December 31, 2018, unless renewed.
- 4. On or about June 6, 2013, the Bureau issued STAR Certification to Respondent Smog All. The STAR Station Certification was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will remain active unless the ARD registration and/or the Smog Check Station license is revoked, cancelled, or the licenses become delinquent or certification is invalidated.
- 5. In 2002, the Bureau issued Advanced Emission Specialist License No. EA 145531 to Issa Sallba Maymoun¹ ("Respondent Maymoun"). Said license was renewed pursuant to Respondent Maymoun's election as a Smog Check Inspector (EO) License No. 145531 and Smog Check Repair Technician (EI) License No. 145531, effective November 9, 2012. The Smog Check Inspector license was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein, and will expire on December 31, 2018, unless renewed. The Smog Check Repair Technician License expired on December 31, 2014, and has not been renewed.

¹ Respondent Maymoun was issued ARD 227311 in 2003 and Smog Check Station License No. TC 227311 on or about March 12, 2004, for his other smog station, Smog All II, located at 1104 E. Palmdale Blvd., Palmdale CA 93550. Both registration and license will expire on April 30, 2019, unless renewed.

² Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 16 section 3340.28, subdivision (e).

6. On or about January 10, 2015, the Bureau issued Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 637761 to Jalal Issa Haddad³ ("Respondent Haddad"). Said license was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein, and will expire on August 31, 2018, unless renewed.

JURISDICTION

- 7. This Accusation is brought before the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs (Director) for the Bureau, under the authority of the following laws.
- 8. Business and Professions Code ("Bus. & Prof. Code") section 9884.13 provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration of a valid registration shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with a disciplinary proceeding against an automotive repair dealer or to render a decision temporarily or permanently invalidating (suspending or revoking) a registration.
- 9. Health and Safety Code ("Health & Saf. Code") section 44002 provides, in pertinent part, that the Director has all the powers and authority granted under the Automotive Repair Act for enforcing the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.
- 10. Health & Saf. Code section 44072.6 provides, in pertinent part, that the expiration or suspension of a license by operation of law, or by order or decision of the Director of Consumer Affairs, or a court of law, or the voluntary surrender of the license shall not deprive the Director of jurisdiction to proceed with disciplinary action.

STATUTORY PROVISIONS

- 11. Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7 states, in pertinent part:
 - (a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may refuse to validate, or may invalidate temporarily or permanently, the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.

³ Respondent Haddad was issued ARD 279248 on or about February 17, 2015 and Smog Check Station License No. TC 279248 on or about March 10, 2015, for his smog station, Smog Quick, located at 400 W. Palmdale Blvd. Unit A, Palmdale, CA 93551. Both registration and license expired on February 29, 2016, and have not been renewed.

(c) The department shall revoke the license of any smog check technician or station licensee who fraudulently certifies vehicles or participates in the fraudulent inspection of vehicles. A fraudulent inspection includes, but is not limited to, all of (4) Intentional or willful violation of this chapter or any regulation. standard, or procedure of the department implementing this chapter . . . Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8 states that when a license has been revoked or suspended following a hearing under this article, any additional license issued under this chapter in the name of the licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director. California Code of Regulations ("CCR"), title 16, section 3340.24, subdivision (c), "The bureau may suspend or revoke the license of or pursue other legal action against a licensee, if the licensee falsely or fraudulently issues or obtains a certificate of compliance or a 19. CCR, title 16, section 3340.30, subdivision (a), states that a licensed smog technician shall at all times "[i]nspect, test and repair vehicles, as applicable, in accordance with section 44012 of the Health & Saf. Code, section 44035 of the Health & Saf. Code, and section 3340,42 20. CCR, title 16, section 3340.35, subdivision (c), states that a licensed smog check station "shall issue a certificate of compliance or noncompliance to the owner or operator of any vehicle that has been inspected in accordance with the procedures specified in section 3340.42 of this article and has all the required emission control equipment and devices installed and CCR, title 16, section 3340.41, subdivision (c), states that "[n]o person shall enter into the emissions inspection system any vehicle identification information or emission control system identification data for any vehicle other than the one being tested. Nor shall any person

2.7

knowingly enter into the emissions inspection system any false information about the vehicle being tested."

22. CCR, title 16, section 3340.42, sets forth specific emissions test methods and procedures which apply to all vehicles inspected in the State of California.

COST RECOVERY

23. Bus. & Prof. Code section 125.3 provides, in pertinent part, that a Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case.

STATEMENT OF FACTS

- 24. On March 9, 2015, the Bureau implemented a statewide regulatory change requiring the use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System (OIS) in testing of 2000 model year and newer gas powered vehicles 14,000 Gross Vehicle Weight Rating (GVW) and under, and 1998 and newer diesel powered vehicles 14,000 GVW and under. The OIS Bureau Test Data lists differences in Vehicle Identification Numbers (VIN) for vehicles that have received smog inspections, in addition to communication protocol (the language used to communicate) and Parameter ID (PID) differences with vehicles that have been certified correctly that are the same make and model vehicles.
- 25. A Bureau representative initiated an investigation and reviewed OIS test data for Respondent Smog All. The investigation revealed that the data related to certain vehicles certified by Respondent Smog All contained a pattern of unmistakable discrepancies between the information transmitted during the inspections and documented information known about the subject vehicles. Specifically, a comparison of the data received from the certified vehicles to data from vehicles of the same year, make, and model and/or prior transmitted inspections for the same certified vehicle determined that the data from at least four (4) of the certified vehicles contained the following unmistakable discrepancies: (1) incorrect vehicle communication protocols and/or (2) incorrect PID counts. Also, discrepancies were found with respect to the

transmitted eVINS (digitally stored VIN number in the vehicle's Power Control Module and identified by the OIS). These documented discrepancies confirm that the vehicles receiving smog certificates from Respondent Smog All were fraudulently tested during the smog inspection using the "clean plugging" method. ⁴

26. Moreover, the OIS test data showed that Smog Check Technicians Respondent Haddad (EO 637761) and Respondent Maymoun (EO 145531) performed three and one of the four (4) fraudulent inspections, respectively. Respondent Maymoun performed fraudulent inspections on July 31, 2017, December 6, 2017, and January 9, 2018. Respondent Haddad performed a fraudulent inspection on May 23, 2017.

27. The following chart illustrates the documented clean plugging activities of Respondents Smog All, Maymoun, and Haddad between May 23, 2017 and January 9, 2018:

	Test Date	Vehicle & License No.	Certificate No.	Fraudulent Passing Inspection Data	Expected OBDII Value
1	5/23/17	2006 Toyota Sienna CE ⁵ 7MEE831	ZV598742C	eVIN: Not Reported	eVIN: 5TDZA23C26S479114 (Expected)
				Comm. Protocol: JPWM	Comm. Protocol: I914
				PID Count: 20	PID Count: 21

(table continues on following page)

///

///

⁴ "Clean plugging" refers to the use of another vehicle's properly functioning On Board Diagnostic, generation II, (OBD II) system, or another source, to generate passing diagnostic readings for the purpose of issuing fraudulent smog Certificates of Compliance to vehicles that are not in smog compliance and/or not present for testing.

⁵ This vehicle was previously tested at another station on May 21, 2015. At that time, the OIS Test Data for this vehicle show that it transmitted the eVIN as 5TDZA23C26S479114 and had the expected communication protocol as I914 and transmitted a PID count of 21.

	Test Vehicle & Certificate Fraudulent Passing Expected OBDII					
	Date	License No.	No.	Inspection Data	[*] Value	
2	7/31/17	2004 Chevrolet Silverado	HD029468C	eVIN: 1GNFC13017R221445 ⁷	eVIN: 1GCECI9V04Z339411	
		C1500 ⁶ 7N69953			1001010101111	
		, /1409933		Comm. Protocol: ICAN11bt5	Comm. Protocol: JVPW	
				10/11/1005	3 7 1 77	
		•		PID Count: 44 7	PID Count: 22	
				44/	22	
3	12/6/17	2007 Honda Accord EX ⁸	НЈ873753С	eVIN: 1HGCR2F51FA233973 ⁹	eVIN: 1HGCM82617A001276	
		5XNN001		mockers it A233973	111GCW182017A001270	
				Comm. Protocol: ICAN29bt5	Comm. Protocol: I914	
				ICAN290t3	1914	
				PID Count: 39	PID Count:	
				39	24	
4	1/9/18	2005 Chevrolet	HL642487C	eVIN:	eVIN:	
		Silverado C1500 ¹⁰		1FTPF12556NA86610 ¹¹	1GCEC14V15Z324053	
		7X76059		Comm. Protocol:	Comm. Protocol:	
				ICAN11bt5	JVPW	
			·	PID Count:	PID Count:	
				44	22	
-						

⁶ This vehicle was previously tested at another station on July 28, 2015. At that time, the OIS Test Data for this vehicle show that it transmitted the eVIN as 1GCECI9V04Z339411 and had the expected communication protocol as JVPW and transmitted a PID count of 22.

⁷ OIS Test Data shows that a 2007 Chevrolet Tahoe C1500 VIN 1GNFC13017R221445 was used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2004 Chevrolet Silverado C1500.

⁹ OIS Test Data shows that a 2015 Honda Accord Sport, VIN 1HGCR2F51FA233973 was used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2007 Honda Accord EX.

8

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

⁸ This vehicle was previously tested at another station on December 8, 2015. At that time, the OIS Test Data for this vehicle show that it transmitted the eVIN as 1HGCM82617A001276 and had the expected communication protocol as 1914 and transmitted a PID count of 24.

¹⁰ This vehicle was previously tested at another station on November 13, 2017. At that time, the OIS Test Data for this vehicle show that it transmitted the eVIN as 1GCEC14V152324053 and had the expected communication protocol as JVPW and transmitted a PID count of 22.

¹¹ OIS Test Data shows that a 2006 Ford F150, VIN 1FTPF12556NA866103 was used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2005 Chevrolet Silverado C1500.

2.5

28. The data analysis conducted on Respondent Smog All shows that Respondents participated in a scheme to perform at least four (4) fraudulent Smog Check inspections resulting in the issuance of four (4)) fraudulent electronic Smog Check Certificates of Compliance between May 23, 2017 and January 9, 2018.

<u>CAUSES FOR DISCIPLINE SUBJECTING ARD REGISTRATION TO DISCIPLINARY</u>
<u>ACTION:</u>

FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Untrue or Misleading Statements)

29. Respondent Smog All's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that Respondent Smog All made or authorized statements which Respondent Smog All knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading, as follows:

Respondent certified that the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above had passed smog inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondent used clean plugging methods for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above.

Respondent substituted or used a different vehicle(s), or another source, during the OBD II functional tests in order to issue smog certificates of compliance for the vehicles. Respondent did not properly test or inspect any of the four (4) vehicles as required by Health & Saf. Code section 44012. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Fraud)

30. Respondent Smog All's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that Respondent Smog All committed acts that constitute fraud by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection

Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Material Violation of Automotive Repair Act)

31. Respondent Smog All's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(6), in that Respondent Smog All failed in a material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it when he issued electronic certificates of compliance for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

CAUSES FOR DISCIPLINE SUBJECTING SMOG CHECK STATION LICENSE TO

DISCIPLINARY ACTION:

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 32. Respondent Smog All's Smog Check Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that Respondent Smog All failed to comply with the following sections of that Code:
- a. <u>Section 44012</u>: Respondent failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- b. <u>Section 44015</u>: Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health & Saf. Code section 44012.

-///

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant

to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 33. Respondent Smog All's Smog Check Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that Respondent Smog All failed to comply with provisions of California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent falsely or fraudulently issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above.
- b. <u>Section 3340.35, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent issued electronic smog certificates of compliance for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, even though the vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42.
- c. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondent knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above.
- d. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondent failed to ensure that the required smog tests were conducted on the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit)

34. Respondent Smog All's Smog Check Station License is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that Respondent Smog All committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27

above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

CAUSES FOR DISCIPLINE SUBJECTING SMOG CHECK INSPECTOR LICENSE AND SMOG CHECK REPAIR TECHNICIAN LICENSE TO DISCIPLINARY ACTION: SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

35. Respondent Maymoun and Respondent Haddad's Smog Check Inspector Licenses, along with Respondent Maymoun's Smog Check Repair Technician License, are subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that they failed to comply with section 44012 of that Code in a material respect, as follows: Respondents Maymoun and Haddad each failed to perform the emission control tests for one or more of the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraphs 27 above, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program)

- 36. Respondent Maymoun and Respondent Haddad's Smog Check Inspector Licenses, along with Respondent Maymoun's Smog Check Repair Technician License, are subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that they failed to comply with provisions of California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
- a. <u>Section 3340.24, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondents Maymoun and Haddad falsely or fraudulently issued one or more electronic smog certificates of compliance for the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above.
- b. <u>Section 3340.30, subdivision (a)</u>: Respondents Maymoun and Haddad each failed to inspect and one or more of the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, in accordance

III

with Health & Saf. Code sections 44012 and 44035, and California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42.

- c. <u>Section 3340.41, subdivision (c)</u>: Respondents Maymoun and Haddad each knowingly entered false information into the emissions inspection system for one or more of the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above.
- d. <u>Section 3340.42</u>: Respondents Maymoun and Haddad each failed to conduct the required smog tests on one or more of the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

NINTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

(Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit)

37. Respondent Maymoun and Respondent Haddad's Smog Check Inspector Licenses, along with Respondent Maymoun's Smog Check Repair Technician License, are subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that Respondents Maymoun and Haddad committed dishonest, fraudulent, or deceitful acts whereby another was injured by issuing electronic smog certificates of compliance for one or more of the four (4) vehicles identified in paragraph 27 above, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates, the allegations contained in paragraphs 24 through 28, above, as though set forth fully herein.

DISCIPLINARY CONSIDERATIONS AS TO RESPONDENT SMOG ALL

- 38. To determine the degree of discipline as to Respondent Smog All, Complainant alleges that:
- a. On or about November 5, 2009, the Bureau issued Respondent Smog All Citation # C2010-0460, for violation of section 44012(f) of the Health and Safety Code, in that Respondent

OTHER MATTERS

- 41. Pursuant to Bus. & Prof. Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this state by Issa S. Maymoun, upon a finding that he has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 42. Pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Station License No. TC 225167, issued to Issa S. Maymoun doing business as Smog All is revoked or suspended following a hearing, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 43. Pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 145531 and/or Smog Check Repair License No. EI 145531 issued to Issa Sallba Maymoun is revoked or suspended following a hearing, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 44. Pursuant to Health & Saf. Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 637761 issued to Jalal Issa Haddad is revoked or suspended following a hearing, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD
 225167 issued to Issa S. Maymoun dba Smog All;
- 2. Revoking or suspending any other automotive repair dealer registration issued to Issa S. Maymoun;
- 3. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Station License No. TC 225167, issued to Issa S. Maymoun dba Smog All;