# BEFORE THE DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS BUREAU OF AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Accusation Against:

Case No.:

79/17-5846

CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES, Owner dba CIRO SMOG CHECK

1535 S. Oxnard Blvd, Unit B Oxnard, CA 93030

Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No.: ARD 216836 Smog Check Test Only Station License No.: TC 216836

and

CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES

1535 S. Oxnard Blvd, Unit B Oxnard, CA 93030

Smog Check Inspector License No.: EO 312195 Smog Check Repair Technician License No.: EI 312195

Respondents.

#### DECISION

The attached Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby accepted and adopted by the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs as the Decision in the above-entitled matter.

This Decision shall become effective

DATED: June 1, 2018

GRACE ARUPO RODRIGUEZ

Assistant Deputy Director

Legal Affairs Division

Department of Consumer Affairs

1	XAVIER BECERRA	
2	Attorney General of California LINDA L. SUN	
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General STEPHEN D. SVETICH	
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 272370	
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013	
6	Telephone: (213) 269-6306 Facsimile: (213) 897-2804	States of Page 1
7	E-mail: Stephen.Svetich@doj.ca.gov  Attorneys for Complainant	
8		RE THE
9	FOR THE BUREAU OF	CONSUMER AFFAIRS AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR
10	STATE OF C	CALIFORNIA
11	In the Metter of the Acquestion Against.	Case No. 79/17-5846
12	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/17-3840
13	CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES, OWNER, DOING BUSINESS AS CIRO SMOG CHECK	STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND
14	1535 S. Oxnard Blvd, Unit B Oxnard, CA 93030	DISCIPLINARY ORDER
15		
16	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 216836 Smag Charles Tools Only Station Linears No.	
17	Smog Check, Test Only, Station License No. TC 216836,	
18	and	
19	CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES 1535 S. Oxnard Blvd, Unit B	
20	Oxnard, CA 93030	
21	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 312195 Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI	
22	312195 (formerly EA 312195)	
23	Respondents.	
24	Respondents.	
25		
26	In the interest of a prompt and speedy settle	ement of this matter, consistent with the public
27	interest and the responsibilities of the Director of	Consumer Affairs (the "Director") and the
28	Bureau of Automotive Repair (the "Bureau"), the	e parties hereby agree to the following Stipulated

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28

"Respondents" herein.

Respondent Ciro Smog Check and Respondent Flores shall be collectively referred to as

1	Pu
2	wa
3	EC
4	20
5	eff
6	rei
7	<b>.</b>
8	
9	ag
10	se
11	co
12	
13	he
14	
15	
16	ch
17	un
18	
19	he
20	the
21	to
22	co
23	an

Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.28, subdivision (e),<sup>2</sup> the license was renewed, pursuant to Respondent Flores' election, as Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 312195, and Smog Check Repair Technician License Number EI 312195, effective July 24, 2012. Respondent Flores' inspector license and repair technician licenses were in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on July 31, 2018, unless renewed.

#### **JURISDICTION**

- 7. Accusation No. 79/17-5846 was filed before the Director, and is currently pending against Respondents. The Accusation and all other statutorily required documents were properly served on Respondents on December 18, 2017. Respondents timely filed a Notice of Defense contesting the Accusation.
- 8. A copy of Accusation No. 79/17-5846 is attached as **Exhibit A** and incorporated herein by reference.

## ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS

- 9. Respondents have carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understands the charges and allegations in Accusation No. 79/17-5846. Respondents have also carefully read and understand the effects of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order.
- 10. Respondents are fully aware of their legal rights in this matter, including the right to a hearing on the charges and allegations in the Accusation; the right to be represented by counsel at their own expense; the right to confront and cross-examine the witnesses against them; the right to present evidence and to testify on their own behalf; the right to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of documents; the right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; and all other rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable laws.

27

28

24

<sup>2526</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Effective August 1, 2012, California Code of Regulations, title 16, sections 3340.28, 3340.29, and 3340.30 were amended to implement a license restructure from the Advanced Emission Specialist Technician ("EA") license and Basic Area ("EB") Technician license to Smog Check Inspector ("EO") license and/or Smog Check Repair Technician ("EI") license.

11. Respondents voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently waive and give up each and every right set forth above.

#### **CULPABILITY**

- 12. Respondents admit the truth of each and every charge and allegation in Accusation No. 79/17-5846.
- 13. Respondent Flores agrees that his Automotive Repair Dealer Registration and Smog Check Test Only Station License are subject to discipline, and Respondent Flores agrees to be bound by the Director's imposition of discipline as set forth in the Disciplinary Order below.
- 14. Respondent Flores agrees that his Smog Check Inspector License and Smog Check Repair Technician License are subject to discipline, and he agrees to be bound by the Director's imposition of discipline as set forth in the Disciplinary Order below.

#### **CONTINGENCY**

- 15. This stipulation shall be subject to approval by the Director of Consumer Affairs or the Director's designee. Respondents understand and agree that counsel for Complainant and the staff of the Bureau of Automotive Repair may communicate directly with the Director and staff of the Department of Consumer Affairs regarding this stipulation and settlement, without notice to or participation by Respondents or their counsel. By signing the stipulation, Respondents understand and agree that they may not withdraw their agreement or seek to rescind the stipulation prior to the time the Director considers and acts upon it. If the Director fails to adopt this stipulation as the Decision and Order, the Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be of no force or effect, except for this paragraph, it shall be inadmissible in any legal action between the parties, and the Director shall not be disqualified from further action by having considered this matter.
- 16. The parties understand and agree that Portable Document Format ("PDF") and facsimile copies of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order, including PDF and facsimile signatures thereto, shall have the same force and effect as the originals.
- 17. This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is intended by the parties to be an integrated writing representing the complete, final, and exclusive embodiment of their agreement.

It supersedes any and all prior or contemporaneous agreements, understandings, discussions, negotiations, and commitments (written or oral). This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order may not be altered, amended, modified, supplemented, or otherwise changed except by a writing executed by an authorized representative of each of the parties.

18. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree that the Director may, without further notice or formal proceeding, issue and enter the following Disciplinary Order:

## **DISCIPLINARY ORDER**

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 216836 issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores, Owner, doing business as Ciro Smog Check, is revoked.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Smog Check Test Only Station License No. TC 216836 issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores, Owner, doing business as Ciro Smog Check, is revoked.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 312195 issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores is revoked.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Smog Check Repair Technician License Number EI 312195 issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores is revoked.

- 1. **Cost Recovery.** The parties understand and agree that for purposes of settlement of this matter, the Bureau defers its right to recover its reasonable costs of investigation and enforcement of Accusation No. 79/17-5846 pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 125.3 in the amount of \$1,212.50. However, the parties understand and agree that should Respondent Ciro Smog Check or Respondent Flores apply in the future for any registration or license issued by the Bureau, said costs of investigation and enforcement will become due and payable at that time.
- 2. The revocation of Respondent Ciro Smog Check's Automotive Repair Dealer Registration and Smog Check Test Only Station License, and the acceptance of the revoked licenses by the Bureau, shall constitute the imposition of discipline against the Respondent Ciro

Smog Check. This stipulation constitutes a record of the discipline and shall become part of Respondent Ciro Smog Check's license history with the Bureau of Automotive Repair.

- 3. Respondent Ciro Smog Check shall lose all rights and privileges of an Automotive Repair Dealer Registration and a Smog Check Test Only Station License in California as of the effective date of the Director's Decision and Order.
- 4. The revocation of Respondent Flores' Smog Check Inspector and Smog Check Repair Technician Licenses, and the acceptance of the revoked licenses by the Bureau, shall constitute the imposition of discipline against the Respondent Flores. This stipulation constitutes a record of the discipline and shall become part of Respondent Flores' license history with the Bureau of Automotive Repair.
- 5. Respondent Flores shall lose all rights and privileges of a Smog Check Inspector in California as of the effective date of the Director's Decision and Order.
- 6. Respondent Flores shall lose all rights and privileges of a Smog Check Repair Technician in California as of the effective date of the Director's Decision and Order.
- 7. Respondents shall cause to be delivered their pocket licenses and, if one was issued, their wall certificates on or before the effective date of the Decision and Order.
- 8. Respondents may apply for licensure or petition for reinstatement one year after the effective date of the Director's Decision and Order.
- 9. If any one of the Respondents ever applies for licensure or petitions for reinstatement in the State of California, the Bureau shall treat it as a new application for licensure. Respondents must comply with all the laws, regulations and procedures for licensure in effect at the time the application or petition is filed, and all of the charges and allegations contained in Accusation No. 79/17-5846 shall be deemed to be true, correct, and admitted by Respondents when the Director determines whether to grant or deny the application or petition.

#### <u>ACCEPTANCE</u>

I have carefully read the Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order. I understand the stipulation and the effect it will have on my Automotive Repair Dealer Registration, and Smog Check Test Only Station License, Smog Check Inspector License, and Smog Check Repair

1	Technician License. I enter into this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order voluntarily,				
2	knowingly, and intelligently, and agree to be bound by the Decision and Order of the Director of				
3	Consumer Affairs.				
4					
5	DATED: 03/05/18 Cm Jhn R				
6	DATED: 03/03/18				
7	CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES, OWNER, DOING BUSINESS AS CIRO SMOG CHECK,				
8	Respondent				
9	DATED: 03/05/2018 Cm Jm_ R				
10	CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES				
11	Respondent				
12	ENDODGERADNE				
13	ENDORSEMENT  The foresting Stimulated Settlement and Dissiplineary Orden in houseless was a College of the Coll				
14	The foregoing Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby respectfully				
15	submitted for consideration by the Director of Consumer Affairs  Dated: April 26, 2018  Respectfully submitted,				
16	XAVIER BECERRA				
17	Attorney General of California LINDA L. SUN				
18	Supervising Deputy Attorney General				
19	Stylia Sulas				
20	STEPHEN D. SVETICH Deputy Attorney General				
21	Attorneys for Complainant				
22	LA2017507154				
23	52806831.doc				
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					

# Exhibit A

Accusation No. 79/17-5846

l l		
1	XAVIER BECERRA	•
2	Attorney General of California LINDA L. SUN	
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General STEPHEN D. SVETICH	
4	Deputy Attorney General	
	State Bar No. 272370 300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702	
5	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6306	
6	Facsimile: (213) 897-2804 E-mail: Stephen.Svetich@doj.ca.gov	·
7	Attorneys for Complainant	
8	BEFOR DEPARTMENT OF C	
9	FOR THE BUREAU OF A	AUTOMOTIVE REPAIR
10	STATE OF C	ALIFORMA
11	To 41 - Decide - Called A - Called A	]
12	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 79/17-5846
13	CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES, OWNER, DOING BUSINESS AS CIRO SMOG	
14	CHECK 1535 S. Oxnard Blvd, Unit B	ACCUSATION
15	Oxnard, CA 93030	
16	Automotive Repair Dealer Registration No. ARD 216836	
17	Smog Check, Test Only, Station License No. TC 216836,	
18	and	
19	CIRO RODRIGUEZ FLORES	
20	1535 S. Oxnard Blvd, Unit B Oxnard, CA 93030	
21	Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 312195	
22	Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 312195	
23	(formerly EA 312195)	
24	Respondents.	
25		<b></b>
26		
27		
00		

### **PARTIES**

1. Patrick Dorais ("Complainant") brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau of Automotive Repair (the "Bureau"), Department of Consumer Affairs.

# Automotive Repair Dealer Registration

2. On or about January 1, 2001, the Bureau issued Automotive Repair Dealer ("ARD") Registration No. ARD 216836 to Ciro Rodriguez Flores, Owner, doing business as Ciro Smog Check ("Respondent Ciro Smog Check"). The ARD Registration was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on June 30, 2018, unless renewed.

# Smog Check Station License

3. On or about August 1, 2001, the Bureau issued Smog Check Test Only Station License No. TC 216836 to Respondent Ciro Smog Check. The Smog Check Test Only Station License was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought herein and will expire on June 30, 2018, unless renewed.

# STAR Certification

4. Respondent Ciro Smog Check is also certified as a STAR Station. The certification was issued on January 16, 2013, and will remain active unless the ARD registration and/or Smog Check Station license is revoked, canceled, licenses become delinquent or certification is invalidated.

#### Inspector License

5. In 1996, the Bureau issued Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License Number EA 312195 to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores ("Respondent Flores"). Respondent Flores' Advanced Emission Specialist Technician License was due to expire on July 31, 2012, however, was cancelled on July 24, 2012. Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 16,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Respondent Ciro Smog Check and Respondent Flores shall be collectively referred to as "Respondents" herein.

2

3

4

- 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

28

<sup>2</sup> Effective August 1, 2012, California Code of Regulations, title 16, sections 3340.28, 3340.29, and 3340.30 were amended to implement a license restructure from the Advanced Emission Specialist Technician ("EA") license and Basic Area ("EB") Technician license to Smog Check Inspector ("EO") license and/or Smog Check Repair Technician ("EI") license. <sup>3</sup> All statutory references herein shall be to the Business and Professions Code unless specifically stated otherwise.

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25 26

27

28

# STATUTORY PROVISIONS

- 11. Section 9884.7 of the Code states:
- "(a) The director, where the automotive repair dealer cannot show there was a bona fide error, may deny, suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration of an automotive repair dealer for any of the following acts or omissions related to the conduct of the business of the automotive repair dealer, which are done by the automotive repair dealer or any automotive technician, employee, partner, officer, or member of the automotive repair dealer.
- "(1) Making or authorizing in any manner or by any means whatever any statement written or oral which is untrue or misleading, and which is known, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known, to be untrue or misleading. . . .
  - "(4) Any other conduct which constitutes fraud. . . .
- "(6) Failure in any material respect to comply with the provisions of this chapter or regulations adopted pursuant to it...."
  - Section 44072.2 of the Health and Safety Code states:

"The director may suspend, revoke, or take other disciplinary action against a license as provided in this article if the licensee, or any partner, officer, or director thereof, does any of the following:

- "(a) Violates any section of this chapter [the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health and Saf. Code, ' 44000, et seq.)] and the regulations adopted pursuant to it, which related to the licensed activities. . . .
  - "(c) Violates any of the regulations adopted by the director pursuant to this chapter.
  - "(d) Commits any act involving dishonesty, fraud, or deceit whereby another is injured. . .
  - Section 44072.10 of the Health and Safety Code states, in pertinent part: 13.
- "(c) The department shall revoke the license of any smog check technician or station license who fraudulently certifies vehicles or participates in the fraudulent inspection of vehicles. A fraudulent inspection includes, but is not limited to, all of the following:

"(1) Clean piping, as defined by the department.	'(1)	Clean piping,	as defined b	by the department
--	------	---------------	--------------	-------------------

"(4) Intentional or willful violation of this chapter or any regulation, standard, or procedure of the department implementing this chapter. . . ."

# REGULATORY PROVISIONS

14. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.24, subdivision (c), states:

"The bureau may suspend or revoke the license of or pursue other legal action against a licensee, if the licensee falsely or fraudulently issues or obtains a certificate of compliance or a certificate of noncompliance."

15. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.30, states:

"A smog check technician shall comply with the following requirements at all times while licensed.

- "(a) A licensed technician shall inspect, test and repair vehicles in accordance with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code, section 44035 of the Health and Safety Code, and section 3340.42 of this article. . . . "
  - 16. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.35, states, in pertinent part:
    "....
- "(c) A licensed station shall issue a certificate of compliance or noncompliance to the owner or operator of any vehicle that has been inspected in accordance with the procedures specified in section 3340.42 of this article and has all the required emission control equipment and devices installed and functioning correctly...."
- 17. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.42, sets forth specific emissions test methods and procedures which apply to all vehicles inspected in the State of California.

## COST RECOVERY

18. Section 125.3 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licentiate found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case, with failure of the licentiate to comply subjecting the license to not being

renewed or reinstated. If a case settles, recovery of investigation and enforcement costs may be included in a stipulated settlement.

## VID DATA REVIEW

- 19. Beginning March 9, 2015, California's Smog Check Program was updated to require the use of an On-Board Diagnostic Inspection System ("OIS"). OIS is the Smog Check equipment required in all areas of the State when inspecting most model-year 2000 and newer gasoline and hybrid vehicles and most 1998 and newer diesel vehicles. The system consists of a certified Data Acquisition Device ("DAD"), computer, bar code scanner, and printer. The DAD is an On Board Diagnostic ("OBD") scan tool that, when requested by the California OIS software, retrieves OBD data from the vehicle. All OBD data that the vehicle indicates it supports is requested by the California OIS software and will be retrieved. The DAD connects between the OIS computer and the vehicle's DLC ("Data Link Connector"). The California OIS software requires a continuous Internet connection when performing a Smog Check inspection and the OIS software communicates with BAR's central database through the Internet connection. The bar code scanner is used to input technician information, the vehicles identification number ("VIN"), and DMV renewal information. The printer provides a Vehicle Inspection Report ("VIN") containing inspection results for motorists and a Smog Check Certificate of Compliance number for passing vehicles.
- 20. Data retrieved and recorded during an OIS smog check includes; the eVIN, which is the digitally stored VIN programmed into the vehicle's Powertrain Control Module ("PCM"); the communication protocol, which is the manufacturer/vehicle specific language the PCM uses to relay information; and the number of Parameter Identifications ("PIDs"), which is the number of specific data values each PCM uses related to emissions controls.
- 21. If the vehicle passes the visual, functional and tailpipe tests, it passes the overall inspection and a Certificate of Compliance is issued and transmitted electronically to the Vehicle Information Database ("VID"). These Certificates of Compliance are purchased in blocks of fifty (50) through the EIS or OIS from the VID, using a pre-arranged electronic bank account debit system or by check, via mail, from Bureau Headquarters in Sacramento. Each Certificate of

--

Compliance has a unique control number so that it can be tracked to determine which Smog Check Station purchased the Certificate of Compliance and to which vehicle it was issued.

- 22. The VID contains registration data from Department of Motor Vehicles ("DMV") plus emission standards, vehicle smog check inspections, smog check stations and technicians, and Certificates of Compliance. The VID receives the passing smog check results immediately following the inspection. During the vehicle registration process, the DMV accesses the VID to verify that the vehicle has been tested and certified. The Bureau can also access the VID to view test data on smog check inspections performed at any Smog Check Station, or search for, retrieve, and print a test record for a particular vehicle which has been tested. The EIS or OIS, depending on the test type, also prints a Vehicle Inspection Report ("VIR"), which is a physical record of the test results and shows the Certificate of Compliance number that was issued if the vehicle passed the smog inspection.
- 23. The smog check technician must sign the VIR under penalty of perjury to indicate that the inspection was done within Bureau guidelines. Smog Check Stations are required by law to maintain a copy of the VIR along with a copy of the repair invoice for three years. The consumer's VIR serves as a receipt and proof that the VID was updated and a Certificate of Compliance was issued. Licensed Smog Check Technicians are the only persons authorized by the Bureau to perform official inspections. They are issued a personal access code and a license, which are used to gain access to the EIS and OIS to perform smog check inspections. Unauthorized use of another technician's access code or license is prohibited.
- 24. Respondents have engaged in numerous acts or omissions constituting violations of the Automotive Repair Act (Business and Professions Code section 9880 *et seq.*) and Motor Vehicle Inspection Program (Health and Safety Code section 44000 *et seq.*) through their practice of "clean plugging." Respondent Ciro Smog Check's OIS Test Data available on the State database indicated that Respondent Ciro Smog Check is involved in fraudulent smog inspection

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Clean plugging" refers to the use of another vehicle's properly functioning On Board Diagnostic, generation II, (OBD II) system, or another source, to generate passing diagnostic readings for the purpose of issuing fraudulent smog Certificates of Compliance to vehicles that are not in smog compliance and/or not present for testing.

1	activities. A Bureau representative initiated an investigation based on information transmitted to
2	the VID for smog check inspections performed by Respondent Flores. The investigation revealed
3	that the data related to certain vehicles certified by Respondent Ciro Smog Check contained a
4	pattern of unmistakable discrepancies between the information transmitted during the inspections
5	and documented information known about the vehicles at issue. Specifically, the representative
6	compared the data received from the certified vehicles to data from vehicles of the same year,
7	make, and model and determined that the data from at least four (4) of the certified vehicles
8	contained the following unmistakable discrepancies: (1) incorrect vehicle communication
9	protocols; (2) incorrect PID counts, and 3) incorrect, missing, and/or unexpected eVin numbers.
LO	These documented discrepancies confirm that the vehicles receiving smog certificates from
11	Respondent Ciro Smog Check were fraudulently tested during the smog inspection using the
12	"clean plugging" method. The following chart ("Table 1") illustrates the documented clean
13	plugging activities of Respondents between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017.
L4	"
۱5	<i>\\\</i> .
16	
17	
18	
L9	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

-		TAI	BLE 1		
No.	Test Date	Vehicle Certified & License No.	Certificate No.	Techician License No.	OIS Test Data Details
1	9/28/2016	2005 Chevrolet Impala LS <sup>5</sup> VIN No. 2G1WH52K059309343	QE593581C	EO 312195 (Respondent Flores)	Comm. Protoco JVPW (expected: JVPW)  PID Count: 21 (expected: 19)
		CA License Plate No. 6RKL389			eVin 1GNCS 18X85K10189 (correct eVin
- 1					expected) Comm. Protoco
	'				ICAN11bt5
2	10/5/2016	2000 Chevrolet Tracker <sup>7</sup>	QE832683C	EO 312195	(expected: I91
		Vin No. 2CNBJ13C8Y6940515		(Respondent Flores)	PID Count: 4 (expected: 17
		CA License Plate No. 6MTD252			eVin 1FTNF20568E
					726878 (eVin not expected)
<sup>5</sup> This specific 2005 Chevrolet Impala LS bearing the same VIN Number and California License Plate Number underwent a smog check inspection at another facility on April 6, 2017. During					
that Smog Check Inspection, the Impala transmitted the correct eVIN, the correct communication					
protocol (JVPW), and the correct PID count (19), consistent with the OIS Test Data and Similar Vehicle OIS Test Data.					
<sup>6</sup> OIS Test Data shows that a 2005 Chevrolet Blazer, bearing VIN No. 1GNCS18X85K101899					

o OIS Test Data shows that a 2005 Chevrolet Blazer, bearing VIN No. 1GNCS18X85K101899 and California License Plate No. 6CKF188, was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2005 Chevrolet Impala LS. Respondent Flores also certified the 2005 Chevrolet Blazer on the same day, September 28, 2016, as the fraudulent inspection of the 2005 Chevrolet Impala LS. The OIS Test Data transmitted for the 2005 Chevrolet Blazer matches the OIS Test Data for the fraudulent inspection of the 2005 Chevrolet Impala LS for the eVIN, protocol, and PID count.

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

. 28

9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> This specific 2000 Chevrolet Tracker bearing the same VIN Number and California License Plate Number underwent a smog check inspection at Respondent Ciro Smog Check's facility by Respondent Flores on September 29, 2014. During that Smog Check Inspection, the Tracker did not transmit an eVin, transmitted the correct communication protocol (1914), and the correct PID count (17), consistent with the OIS Test Data and Similar Vehicle OIS Test Data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> OIS Test Data shows that a 2008 Ford F250 Super Duty, bearing VIN No.

<sup>1</sup>FTNF20568EB72687 and California License Plate No. 54742Cl, was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2000 Chevrolet Tracker. Respondent Flores also certified the 2008 Ford F250 Super Duty on the same day, October 5, 2016, as the fraudulent inspection of the 2000 Chevrolet Tracker. The OIS Test Data transmitted for the 2008 Ford F250 Super Duty matches the OIS Test Data for the fraudulent inspection of the 2000 Chevrolet Tracker for the eVIN, protocol, and PID count.

					Comm, Protocol;
3	12/28/2016	2001 Chevrolet Silverado C2500HD9	ZN134511C	EO 312195 (Respondent	(expected: JVPW)
		Vin No. 1GCHC24U41Z258277 CA License Plate No.		Flores)	PID Count: 17 (expected: 22)
		6R30584			eVin 1GCCS1456YK2 78940 <sup>10</sup>
	720 10 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 10				(correct eVin expected)
			· · ·		Comm. Protocol ICAN11bt5 (expected: ICAN11bt5)
4	2/10/2017	2007 GMC Acadia SLT-1 <sup>11</sup> Vin No.	ZP381646C	EO 312195 (Respondent Flores)	PID Count: 43 (expected: 43   7
		1GKER23797J106147			eVin 5N1AR1NB1AC 611466 <sup>12</sup>
-			in il		(correct eVin expected)

14 | 9 This specific

. 13

Communication protocol (JVPW), and the correct PID count (22), consistent with the OIS Test Data and Similar Vehicle OIS Test Data.

10 OIS Test Data shows that a 2000 Chevrolet S Truck S10, bearing VIN No.

1GCCS1456YK278940 and California License Plate No. 93942E1, was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2001 Chevrolet Silverado C2500HD. Respondent Flores also certified the 2000 Chevrolet S Truck S10 on the same day, December 28, 2016, as the fraudulent inspection of the 2001 Chevrolet Silverado C2500HD. The OIS Test Data transmitted for the 2000 Chevrolet S Truck S10 matches the OIS Test Data for the fraudulent inspection of the 2001 Chevrolet Silverado C2500HD for the eVIN, protocol, and PID count.

This specific 2007 GMC Acadia SLT-1 bearing the same VIN Number underwent a smog check inspection at Respondent Ciro Smog Check's facility by Respondent Flores on February 13, 2017. During that Smog Check Inspection, the Acadia transmitted the correct eVIN, the correct Communication protocol (ICAN11bt5), and the correct PID count (43 | 7), consistent with the OIS Test Data and Similar Vehicle OIS Test Data.

<sup>12</sup> OIS Test Data shows that a 2010 Nissan Pathfinder S, bearing VIN No. 5N1AR1NR1AC611466 and California License Plata No. 7EU 020, was the

5N1AR1NB1AC611466 and California License Plate No. 7FIL930, was the vehicle used to generate the fraudulent Smog Certificate of Compliance for the 2007 GMC Acadia SLT-1. Respondent Flores also certified the 2010 Nissan Pathfinder S on the same day, February 10, 2017, as the fraudulent inspection of the 2007 GMC Acadia SLT-1. The OIS Test Data transmitted for the 2010 Nissan Pathfinder S matches the OIS Test Data for the fraudulent inspection of the 2007 GMC Acadia SLT-1 for the eVIN, protocol, and PID count.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> This specific 2001 Chevrolet Silverado C2500HD bearing the same VIN Number and California License Plate Number underwent a smog check inspection at another facility on July 15, 2016. During that Smog Check Inspection, the Silverado transmitted the correct eVIN, the correct communication protocol (JVPW), and the correct PID count (22), consistent with the OIS Test Data and Similar Vehicle OIS Test Data.

25. This data of Respondents' smog check activities between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, shows that Respondents participated in a scheme to perform at least four (4) fraudulent Smog Check inspections resulting in the issuance of four (4) fraudulent electronic Smog Check Certificates of Compliance,

#### FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Untrue or Misleading Statements - Respondent Ciro Smog Check)

26. Respondent Ciro Smog Check's registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(1), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, Respondent Ciro Smog Check made or authorized statements which it knew or in the exercise of reasonable care should have known to be untrue or misleading, as follows: Respondent Ciro Smog Check certified that the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, had passed inspection and were in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. In fact, Respondent Ciro Smog Check conducted the inspections on those vehicles using the clean plugging method in order to issue smog certificates of compliance, and did not test or insect the vehicles as required by Health and Safety Code section 44012.

#### SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Fraud - Respondent Ciro Smog Check)

Respondent Ciro Smog Check's registration is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to section 9884.7, subdivision (a)(4), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, Respondent Ciro Smog Check committed acts which constitute fraud by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devises and systems on those vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

 $\parallel$ 

28

II

 $\parallel$ 

#### THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Comply with the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Ciro Smog Check)

- 28. Respondent Ciro Smog Check's station license is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Ciro Smog Check failed to comply with the following sections of the Health and Safety Code:
- (a) Section 44012: Respondent Ciro Smog Check failed to ensure that the emission control tests were performed on the vehicles, in accordance with procedures prescribed by the department.
- (b) Section 44015: Respondent Ciro Smog Check issued electronic certificates of compliance for the vehicles, without ensuring that the vehicles were properly tested and inspected to determine if they were in compliance with Health and Safety Code section 44012.

### FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program - Respondent Ciro Smog Check)

- 29. Respondent Ciro Smog Check's station license is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Ciro Smog Check failed to comply with the following provisions of the California Code of Regulations, Title 16, as follows:
- (a) Section 3340.35, subdivision (c): Respondent Ciro Smog Check issued electronic certificates of compliance even though those vehicles had not been inspected in accordance with section 3340.42, Title 16, of the California Code of Regulations.
- (b) Section 3340.42: Respondent Ciro Smog Check failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on those vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

### 

## 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

# 

### FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit - Respondent Ciro Smog Check)

30. Respondent Ciro Smog Check's station license is subject to disciplinary action pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Ciro Smog Check committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

# SIXTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Violations of the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program - Respondent Flores)

31. Respondent Flores' technician licenses are subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (a), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Flores failed to comply with section 44012 of the Health and Safety Code in a material respect, as follows: Respondent Flores failed to perform the emission control tests on those vehicles in accordance with produces prescribed by the department.

# SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Comply with Regulations Pursuant to the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program – Respondent Flores)

- 32. Respondent Flores' technician licenses are subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (c), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Flores failed to comply with provisions of the California Code of Regulations, title 16, as follows:
  - (a) Section 3340.30, subdivision (a): Respondent Flores failed to inspect and test those vehicles in accordance with Health and Safety Code section 44012.

# 

 $\parallel$ 

(b) Section 3340.42: Respondent Flores failed to conduct the required smog tests and inspections on those vehicles in accordance with the Bureau's specifications.

### EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

## (Dishonesty, Fraud or Deceit - Respondent Flores)

33. Respondent Flores' technician licenses are subject to discipline pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 44072.2, subdivision (d), in that between September 28, 2016, and February 10, 2017, regarding the vehicles set forth above in Table 1, Respondent Flores committed acts involving dishonesty, fraud or deceit whereby another was injured by issuing electronic certificates of compliance for those vehicles without performing bona fide inspections of the emission control devices and systems on the vehicles, thereby depriving the People of the State of California of the protection afforded by the Motor Vehicle Inspection Program.

### **OTHER MATTERS**

- 34. Pursuant to Business & Professions Code section 9884.7, subdivision (c), the Director may suspend, revoke, or place on probation the registration for all places of business operated in this State by Ciro Rodriguez Flores upon a finding that Respondent Ciro Smog Check has, or is, engaged in a course of repeated and willful violations of the laws and regulations pertaining to an automotive repair dealer.
- 35. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Test Only Station License Number TC 216836 issued to Ciro Rodriguez Flores, doing business as Ciro Smog Check, is revoked or suspended following a hearing under this article, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.
- 36. Pursuant to Health & Safety Code section 44072.8, if Smog Check Inspector License Number EO 312195 or Smog Check Repair Technician License EI 312195 issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores is revoked or suspended following a hearing under this article, any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of said licensee may be likewise revoked or suspended by the Director.

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27 28 **DISCIPLINARY CONSIDERATIONS** 

- 37. On or about June 25, 2002, the Bureau issued Citation No. C2002-1154 to Respondent Ciro Smog Check for violating Health and Safety Code section 44012, subdivision (f), and California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 3340.35(c). The Bureau assessed a civil penalty of \$500.00. The Bureau received payment in full for the citation on July 18, 2002.
- 38. On or about May 13, 2015, the Bureau issued Citation No. C2015-0506 to Respondent Ciro Smog Check for violating Health and Safety Code section 44012. The Bureau assessed a civil penalty of \$1,000.00. The Bureau received payment in full for the citation on July 6, 2015.
- 39. On or about May 13, 2015, the Bureau issued Citation No. M2015-0507 to Respondent Flores for violating Health and Safety Code section 44032. The citation included an order of abatement. The decision became effective July 19, 2015.

### PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Revoking or suspending Automotive Repair Dealer Registration Number ARD 216836, issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores, doing business as Ciro Smog Check;
- Revoking or suspending any other Automotive Repair Dealer registration license issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores;
- Revoking or suspending Smog Check, Test Only Station License Number TC 3. 216836, issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores, doing business as Ciro Smog Check;
- 4, Revoking or suspending Smog Check Inspector License No. EO 312195 issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores;
- 5. Revoking or suspending Smog Check Repair Technician License No. EI 312195 issued to Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores;
- Revoking or suspending any additional license issued under Chapter 5 of Part 5 of 6. Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code in the name of Respondent Ciro Rodriguez Flores;